## IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE NORTHERN DISTRICT OF ILLINOIS EASTERN DIVISION

ROSILENE HEMME, Special Administrator of the Estate of HAUS HEMME, deceased, et al.,

Plaintiffs,

Civil Action No. 1:09-CV-7239

VS.

AIRBUS S.A.S., et al.,

District Judge Charles P. Kocoras

Defendants.

Magistrate Judge Maria Valdez

THALES AVIONICS S.A.,

Third-Party Plaintiff,

VS.

SOCIÉTÉ AIR FRANCE,

Third-Party Defendant.

## **MOTION TO DISMISS**

Third-Party Defendant Société Air France's ("Air France"), pursuant to Fed. R. Civ. P. 12(b)(1), moves the Court to dismiss the Third-Party Complaint of Thales Avionics S.A. ("Thales") for lack of subject matter jurisdiction on the following grounds:

(1) Courts of the United States lack subject matter jurisdiction over passenger death claims against Air France because such claims are governed exclusively by the Montreal Convention ("MC"),<sup>1</sup> and none of the five places where these claims can be brought, as specified in Article 33 of the MC, is in the United States. Thales' third-party claims for contribution and

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Convention for the Unification of Certain Rules for International Carriage by Air, concluded at Montreal, Canada, May 28, 1999, *reprinted in S. Treaty Doc.* 106-45, 1999 WL 33292734.

Case 1:09-cv-07239 Document 172 Filed 02/10/10 Page 2 of 4

indemnity against Air France are derivative of Plaintiffs' claims. Accordingly, there is no subject

matter jurisdiction over Thales' third-party claims.

(2) Courts of the United States lack subject matter jurisdiction over claims arising from

the death of Clara Amado, a member of the Air France flight crew. Pursuant to French law and

Ms. Amado's employment contract with Air France, the French "Tribunal des affaires de securite

sociale" ("Court for social security matters") has exclusive jurisdiction over any claims arising

from her death.

In support of its motion to dismiss, Air France files herewith a Memorandum of Law, the

Declaration of Gail Muntner, the Declaration of Nicole I. Tellier, and the Declaration of Judith

R. Nemsick in support thereof.

WHEREFORE, Air France prays that the Court dismiss the Third-Party Complaint

against it.

Dated: February 10, 2010

2

Respectfully submitted,

## **HOLLAND & KNIGHT LLP**

By\_\_/s/ Troy D. Hoyt

Robert E. Tonn
Troy D. Hoyt
131 South Dearborn Street
30th Floor
Chicago, Illinois 60603
Tel No. (312) 263-3600
Fax No. (312) 578-6666

-and-

HOLLAND & KNIGHT LLP Christopher G. Kelly Alan D. Reitzfeld 31 West 52nd Street New York, New York 10019 Tel No. (212) 513-3200 Fax No. (212) 385-9010

Attorneys for Defendant Société Air France

## **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

The undersigned hereby certifies that on **February 10, 2010**, the foregoing **MOTION TO DISMISS** was filed with Clerk of the Court using the CM/ECF System, which automatically transmitted a Notice of Electronic Filing to all ECF registrants.

/s/ Troy D. Hoyt \_\_\_\_

# 9151484\_v1